September 24, 2001

Mr. John Peeler Legal Counsel for the Texas State Board of Educator Certification Administrative Law Division Office of the Attorney General P.O. Box 12548 Austin, Texas 78711-1548

OR2001-4282

Dear Mr. Peeler:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 152461.

The State Board for Educator Certification (the "board") received a request for "the petitions filed against [certain] educators, any teacher responses to the [requestor's clients'] complaints, and any documents addressing the status or disposition of these matters." In your letter to the requestor, a copy of which you submitted to this office, you indicate that the board does not have any petitions or teacher responses that would be responsive to this request. You claim, moreover, that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.107 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.107(1) of the Government Code excepts information "that the attorney general or an attorney of a political subdivision is prohibited from disclosing because of a duty to the client under the Texas Rules of Civil Evidence, the Texas Rules of Criminal Evidence, or the Texas Disciplinary Rules of Professional Conduct[.]" While section 552.107(1)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>We note that the Public Information Act does not require a governmental body to disclose information that did not exist at the time the request was received. *Economic Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.--San Antonio 1978, writ dism'd); Open Records Decision No. 452 at 3 (1986).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

appears to apply to information within rule 1.05 of the Texas Disciplinary Rules of Professional Conduct, this office has determined that section 552.107 cannot be applied as broadly as written to information in the possession of an attorney for a governmental body. Open Records Decision No. 574 (1990). Section 552.107(1) was found to protect only the attorney's communication of legal advice or opinion to the client and communications from a client to an attorney where those communications are made in confidence and in furtherance of the attorney rendering professional legal service to the governmental body. *Id.* at 5. Moreover, section 552.107(1) does not except purely factual information from disclosure. *Id.* We determine the applicability of section 552.107(1) on a case-by-case basis. Based on our review of the submitted information, we agree that the submitted information reflects an attorney's legal advice or opinions that the board may withhold under section 552.107.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the General Services Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

Karen A. Eckerle

Assistant Attorney General Open Records Division

Karen a. Eckerte

KAE/sdk

Ref: ID# 152461

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Ms. Elaine B. Roberts

Bruckner Burch PLLC

5847 San Felipe, Suite 3900

Houston, Texas 77057

(w/o enclosures)